

MEXICAN WOLF ADAPTIVE MANAGEMENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE¹

SUMMARY NOTES FOR MEETING ON OCTOBER 28-29, 2008

NOTE: THIS IS A PUBLIC DOCUMENT

FINAL: NOVEMBER 12, 2008

Location: Glenwood Ranger District Office, ¼ mi south of Glenwood NM on west side of US Hwy 180
Date/Time: October 28 at 1000-1700 and October 29 at 0900-1500 (NM Time)
Convener: Arizona Game and Fish Department
Participants: Lead Agencies: AGFD, NMDGF, USFS, USDA-WS, and USFWS
Signatory Cooperators: GRAHCO, GRECO, NACO, NMDA
IFT: AGFD, NMDGF, USFS, USFWS
OTHERS: None

1. Welcome, opening comments, and ground rules. Chair Terry B. Johnson (AGFD) welcomed all attendees. No opening comments were made and the usual ground rules were employed.
2. Agenda review, additional discussion points, and special announcements. No items were added to the agenda and no special announcements were made.
3. Discussion of Summary Notes from Previous AMOC and/or AMWG Meeting(s). All Summary Notes for previous meetings had been finalized and posted to the Project Web site, so they were not discussed any further.

Current Action Items

1. Evaluate how to increase effectiveness of public participation in AMWG meetings (assigned 4/22/08). Discussed in AMOC on July 29-31 and in AMWG on July 30. Consensus to cut-back AMOC and AMWG meetings to three times per year in 2009 et seq. In 2009 et seq., move AMWG meetings back to end (1600-2000) of AMOC and Director Summit sessions. Explore possible changes in AMWG meeting format that might engage more attendees in substantive matters, such as issue-based discussions. Consider implementing changes in October 2008 AMWG meeting, with results-driven adjustments in subsequent meetings.
 - a. Kay Gale (assigned 7/30/08): convene small work group (invitation only) to develop recommendations on changing AMWG meetings to elicit increased public participation, and by August 31 report to AMOC Chair on progress to date. **Status: completed; Kay Gale provided verbal report in October 28-29 AMOC meeting.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 to discuss and act on work group recommendations. **Status: completed; recommendations**

¹The Reintroduction Project is a state- and tribally-led collaborative effort among six Lead Agencies and five Signatory Cooperators. Lead Agencies are: Arizona Game and Fish Department (AGFD); New Mexico Department of Game and Fish (NMDGF), USDA-APHIS Wildlife Services (WS), U.S. Forest Service (USFS), U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), and White Mountain Apache Tribe (WMAT). Signatory Cooperators are: Graham, Greenlee, and Navajo counties, Arizona; New Mexico Department of Agriculture; and Sierra County, New Mexico.

- discussed in October 28-29 AMOC meeting and referred back to Kay Gale for further work group consideration (see 1e, below).**
- c. AMOC (assigned 7/30/08): by September 30, 2008, decide which, if any, work group recommendations to implement in October 29 AMWG meeting. **Status: closed out; work group report not presented in time for changes to be considered for the October 29 AMWG meeting.**
 - d. AMOC (assigned 10/21/08) consideration of two AMWG meeting changes suggested by Terry Johnson. **Status: completed; changes in AMWG meeting timing and use of an evaluation form discussed in October 28-29 AMOC and AMWG meetings and referred to Kay Gale for further work group consideration (see 1e, below).**
 - e. Kay Gale (assigned 10/29/08) to reconvene a work group to reconsider all available comment on possible changes in AMWG meetings (frequency, timing, and format) and report back to AMOC in writing by 12/19/08. **Status: pending Kay Gale report.**
2. Nail down specific dates and locations (meeting rooms, facility contacts) for 2008-2010 AMOC, Director Summit, and AMWG meetings (assigned 4/22/08, revised 7/29/08). AMOC and Director Summit meeting rooms must be large enough for 30 and preferably 40 participants. AMWG meeting rooms must be large enough for 75 participants. Discussed in AMOC on July 29-31; 2008-2010 schedule revised and approved.
- a. Terry Johnson (assigned 5/20/08): by June 15, confirm whether Steve Titla has confirmed accommodation and room availability for April 2009 AMOC and AMWG meetings scheduled for SCAT Apache Gold Casino and Conference Center. **Status: completed 9/10/08; Steve Titla confirmed meeting rooms reserved for AMOC and AMWG. Individuals responsible for lodging reservations (no special rates apply).**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/29/08): secure facilities for AMOC and AMWG meetings in December 2009. **Status: closed out; see 2f, below.**
 - c. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/29/08): secure facilities for AMOC and AMWG meetings in April, August, and December 2010. **Status: closed out; AMOC decided on 9/09/08 that Terry Johnson will resolve rotation conflicts and secure facilities.**
 - d. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/29/08): update AMOC on AMOC/AMWG meeting schedule for 2008, 2009, and 2010. **Status: closed out; see 2f, below.**
 - e. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): by August 15, send an *ES Update* on dates, times, locations of October 2008 and all 2009 AMWG meetings. **Status: closed out; see 2f, below.**
 - f. Terry Johnson (assigned 10/28-29/08): update AMOC **Status: pending; after AMOC discussion in conference calls on 11/12/08 and 1/13/09, Terry Johnson will issue an update for 2009, 2010, and 2011 schedules.**
3. Ensure complete coverage of all FTE allocations to IFT (assigned 4/22/08). All Lead Agency Directors committed to ensuring that significant gaps in IFT coverage do not occur due to employee resignation, leave, and other priority assignments. However, some positions in NMDGF and USFWS have remained unfilled for months, and TDAs are not being used to fully cover short-term or other vacancies, resulting in gaps in IFT coverage and pressuring remaining IFT members to handle the workload.
- a. Maggie Dwire (assigned 7/30/08): resolve gaps in USFWS backup coverage for John Oakleaf at field level (i.e. FPC, co-investigation, SCAT, and other field responsibilities) and TDA coverage for short and long-term vacancies in USFWS component of IFT. **Status: pending; issue referred to Directors in November 2008.**

- b. Matt Wunder (assigned 7/30/08): resolve gaps in TDA coverage for short and long-term vacancies in NMDGF component of IFT. **Status: pending; issue referred to Directors in November 2008.**
- 4. Determine whether to establish a temporary holding facility for Project use (assigned 4/22/08). Various interim steps completed in May-July 2008, including AMOC discussion with Directors on July 30, but final decision package not yet produced.
 - a. Cynthia Dale (assigned 4/23/08): work with IFTLs and FPC to add FAIR information to recommendation for temporary holding facility. **Status: pending; WMAT considering alternatives for FAIR.**
 - b. IFTLs (assigned 9/9/08) to develop proposal sections regarding remote ASNF site and contrast its values to USFS Alpine Admin and AGFD Sipe sites. Submit information to TBJ by September 30. **Status: completed; AGFD, USFS, and USFWS comment received September 29; NMDGF comment received September 30; WMAT and WS comment not received.**
 - c. AMOC (assigned 9/9/08): final action on proposal at October 28-29 AMOC meeting. **Status: completed; revised proposal discussed in October 28-29 AMOC meeting.**
 - d. IFT (assigned 10/29/08): submit detailed cost estimate to AMOC Chair by November 28 for pen construction at remote site on USFS lands. **Status: pending.**
- 5. 2006 NEPA Addendum to 2003 AMOC MOU (assigned 4/22/08).
 - a. Cynthia Dale (assigned 7/29/08): determine whether WMAT wants to become a NEPA Cooperator and apprise AMOC Chair of decision. **Status: pending; WMAT action deferred until overarching NMDGF issues with 2003 MOU resolved.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/29/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 regarding acceptance of additional AZ and NM counties that have requested status as NEPA Addendum Cooperators under 2003 MOU. **Status: pending; discussion deferred until overarching NMDGF issues with 2003 MOU resolved.**
- 6. Delineate USFWS expectations of AMOC cooperators in NEPA process for revision of 10j rule (assigned 5/20/08).
 - a. John Slown (assigned 5/20/08): find out what USFWS expects each cooperator to provide for EIS/NEPA process, and discuss at June cooperators meeting, if one occurs. Update July 31: after discussing slow progress and concerns about USFWS resource (funding and staff) constraints in the July 29-31 AMOC meeting, cooperators identified various alternatives (county, state, and federal agency resources) that would help move NEPA forward. Slown then said USFWS will provide additional information on resource needs and agency expectations in a September 10-11 NEPA Cooperators meeting in ABQ. **Status: closed out; USFWS announced at September NEPA meeting that it lacks funds for further EIS action. No further AMOC action possible.**
- 7. Resolve whether funding is sufficient to cover helicopter and fixed-wing flight support for Project in FY2009 (assigned 5/20/08). Update July 31: total projected need \$179,217 for fixed-wing and helicopter flights (including weekly monitoring, capture/removal, end-of-year count, and contingency flights). NMDGF providing at least \$47,000 and AGFD providing at least \$98,202, so minimum shortfall is \$34,015 and maximum shortfall would be \$85,217 if AGFD cuts back to \$47,000 (i.e. same level as current NMDGF commitment).
 - a. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): by August 22, inform Lead Agency Directors that funds available are not sufficient for helicopter and fixed-wing flight support for FY2009. **Status: pending.**

- b. Lead Agency Directors (assigned 7/30/08): provide guidance to AMOC on how to resolve shortfall (e.g. cut back flights, cut back area of coverage, and/or secure more funds). **Status: pending.**
- c. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 regarding Directors guidance on funding for flights. **Status: pending.**
- 8. IFT activity priorities and possible need for additional resources, including more personnel (assigned 5/20/08). Update July 31: AMOC discussed issue in April, May, June, and July. AMOC consensus: disagreements among Lead Agencies not resolvable at AMOC level.
 - a. AMOC representatives (assigned 7/30/08): discuss IFT FTE table with Director and report back to AMOC on guidance received. **Status: pending; AMOC unable to resolve conflicts; issue referred to Directors in November 2008.**
 - b. Lead Agency Directors (assigned 7/30/08): by September 15, provide guidance to AMOC on preferred solutions to disagreements. **Status: pending.**
 - c. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 regarding Directors guidance on IFT priorities, staffing levels, and workloads. **Status: pending.**
- 9. Public comment periods for draft Project SOPs and Clarification Memos (assigned 5/20/08). Need to reaffirm Lead Agency Director consensus (or lack thereof) on AMOC providing public comment periods for all draft SOPs and Clarification Memos. Issue scheduled for July 2008 Directors Summit, but time constraints precluded discussion.
 - a. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/31/08): notify Directors that further guidance is needed for AMOC on whether “public comment periods” for Project SOPs and Clarification Memos are mandatory or discretionary. **Status: pending; issue referred to Directors in November 2008.**
- 10. Develop decision package for initial releases and translocations for September 2008 through December 2009 (assigned 5/20/08). Update July 31: on July 29-31, AMOC Lead Agency representatives reviewed IFT draft 2008-2009 initial release and translocation document. Draft document discussed with Directors on July 31. Directors approved moving revised proposal forward in accordance with SOPs 5.0 and 6.0. Final decisions on specific initial releases translocations will await completion of public meetings in Arizona and Directors concurrence afterward.
 - a. Chris Bagnoli and Dave Cagle (assigned 7/31/08): schedule and conduct AZ public meetings and handle any other contacts/notices required by SOPs 5.0 and 6.0 for initial releases and translocations proposed in AZ for 2008 and 2009. **Status: completed. Meeting with local AZ permittees held September 9 in Springerville AZ and AZ public meeting held September 15 in Alpine AZ. Comments from both meetings integrated into Project decision document and disseminated to AMOC et al. for consideration.**
 - b. Ellen Heilhecker (assigned 7/31/08): handle all contacts/notices required by SOP 6.0 for translocations in NM in 2008 and 2009. **Status: completed 9/30/08.**
 - c. AMOC and Signatory Cooperators (assigned 9/17/08): by October 6, provide agency-head comment on decision document to AMOC Chair. **Status: completed 10/6/08; comment received from AGFD, USFS, and USFWS; no comment from NMDGF, WMAT, WS, or Signatory Cooperators.**

- d. AMOC Chair (assigned 9/17/08): by October 7, disseminate revised decision document to Jurisdictional Lead Agency Directors (AGFD, NMDGF, and USFWS) for final approval. **Status: completed 10/7/08.**
 - e. Jurisdictional Lead Agency Directors (AGFD, NMDGF, and USFWS) (assigned 9/17/08): inform AMOC Chair of final decisions on decision document by October 14. **Status: completed 10/15/08.**
 - f. AMOC Chair (assigned 9/17/08): by October 14, notify AMOC, IFTLs, FPC, Signatory Cooperators, and the public of Jurisdictional Lead Agency Directors (AGFD, NMDGF, and USFWS) decision on decision document. **Status: completed 10/15/08.**
11. Leadership Transition planning for AMOC (assigned 5/4/08). Lead Agency Directors told AMOC to develop a plan that would ensure a smooth and prompt transition when the current Chair needs to be replaced (current term ends in December 2009). Update June 17: Terry Johnson provided brief concepts he is thinking of for transition planning.
- a. Matt Wunder, Cynthia Dale, and Terry Johnson (assigned 5/17/08): exchange initial brainstorming ideas by June 30, and convey draft integrated description to AMOC prior to July 11 for discussion in July 29-31 AMOC meeting. Update June 30: on June 18, WMAT informed Terry Johnson they opt not to participate in leadership transition planning; no ideas provided by Wunder or Johnson; issue placed on AMOC agenda for July 29-31. Update June 30: no information provided by Matt Wunder or Terry Johnson. Update July 23: no information exchanged; issue on AMOC agenda for July 29-31. Update July 31: issue discussed in AMOC July 29-30 meeting. Cynthia Dale reaffirmed WMAT decision not to take on leadership responsibilities. Matt Wunder reaffirmed NMDGF Director Thompson's interest in NMDGF assuming responsibilities of Chair (the person might or might not be Matt) but had no further information. Terry Johnson reaffirmed previously-stated AMOC majority opinion that leadership involves more than identifying someone to convene and run AMOC meetings. It is time intensive and requires knowledge of AMOC history as well as emergent issues. Difficult to see how NMDGF could take on greater responsibility for leadership when, due to workload or other issues, existing responsibilities are not being handled. Decision: in absence of further information from NMDGF, all agreed that Terry will continue to rely on Dave Cagle (AGFD) as necessary for support as surrogate AMOC Chair. **Status: closed out 10/29/08; Matt Wunder indicated NMDGF is still under direction to plan for more of a leadership role but believes that fundamental issues of AMOC organization and structure need to be addressed in advance of or in tandem with any leadership transition; Chair Johnson assigned various tasks to NMDGF to handle (i.e. future management decisions or Removal Orders pertaining to AM1114 in NM; facilitating 10/29 AMWG meeting in Glenwood NM).**
12. Discussion of wolf mortalities in 2008 (assigned 6/10/08). Update June 17: due to lack of time, AMOC discussion deferred to July AMOC meeting. Update July 31: issue discussed in AMOC meeting on July 29-31, in conjunction with discussion of apparent Project bottleneck between ca. 40 and 60 free-ranging wolves. Comprehensive management alternatives identified for further refinement by (a) USFWS-convened work group (AGFD, NMDGF, USFWS, and WMAT) and then by (b) review with AMOC before submittal for consideration by Lead Agency Directors. Law enforcement alternatives being developed by separate multi-agency task force; LE alternatives will be kept confidential, on a "need to know" basis. Update August 4: USFWS work group will meet in ABQ on August 26-27 to revise draft

- alternatives and recommendations for management actions. LE task force still on separate path and timeline and activities uncertain.
- a. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/31/08): revise draft management recommendations after September 9 AMOC conference call determines next course of action. **Status: closed out; USFWS resumed ownership of this issue in October 2008.**
 13. Draft conventions for formatting Project documents (assigned 7/30/08).
 - a. AMOC, IFTLs, and FPC (assigned 7/30/08): provide Track Changes comment to Terry Johnson by August 31. **Status: closed out; no responses received.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 to discuss and take action on draft conventions for formatting Project documents. **Status: closed out; no responses received; draft guidelines adopted 10/29/08 by silent consensus.**
 14. Draft "roles and responsibilities" document (assigned 7/31/08).
 - a. Lead Agency representatives (assigned 7/31/08): discuss draft "roles and responsibilities" document with Director and provide Track Changes comment to Terry Johnson by August 31. **Status: closed out; see 14 b, below.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 to discuss Lead Agency feedback on draft "roles and responsibilities" document. **Status: pending; no cooperator response to 8/31 deadline or in 9/09 conference call; comment deadline extended to 10/15 but no responses received; action deferred to October 28-29 AMOC meeting; USFS response received 10/28 but no other responses; document will be revised and finalized by 11/28/08.**
 15. Re-consideration of Project guidelines for loaning radio-telemetry receivers to the public (assigned 7/30/08).
 - a. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): convene AMOC conference call in September 2008 to discuss and take action on IFT recommendations regarding radio-telemetry receiver loan. **Status: completed in October 28-29 AMOC meeting.**
 16. Revision of draft Clarification Memos for SOPs 11.0 and 13.0.
 - a. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/31/08): submit AMOC-revised draft Clarification Memos to Lead Agency Directors for consideration and further guidance to AMOC. **Status: pending; related issues discussed in AMOC conference call on 9/9 and 10/28-29 AMOC meeting; action deferred to 11/12 AMOC conference call.**
 17. Update BRWRA Project summary of costs-to-date (assigned 7/30/08).
 - a. AMOC Lead Agency Representatives (assigned 7/30/08): by August 31, provide revised information for 2008 and 2009 to Terry Johnson. **Status: no responses received except from WS. TBJ to send reminder message.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 7/30/08): update Project costs-to-date summary and re-post on Project Web site by September 30. **Status: Status: TBJ awaiting Lead Agency responses in preceding Action Item.**
 18. Completion of Summary Notes for AMOC meeting on September 9 (assigned 9/9/08).
 - a. Terry Johnson (assigned 9/9/08): draft Summary Notes and distribute them to AMOC et al. for review. **Status: completed.**
 - b. AMOC, IFTLs, FPC, and Signatory Cooperators (assigned 9/9/08): submit review comments on draft Summary Notes to Terry Johnson by September 19. **Status: closed out; see 18a, above.**

- c. Terry Johnson (assigned 9/9/08): disseminate final (approved) Summary Notes for September 9 AMOC meeting and post them to Project Web site. **Status: completed.**
- 19. Complete AMOC white paper on management response to Mexican wolf population losses (assigned 9/16/08).
 - a. AMOC, IFTLs, FPC, and Signatory Cooperators: by September 30, submit comment on TBJ draft. **Status: completed.**
 - b. TBJ: by October 6, revise document and disseminate to AMOC et al. for discussion with their agency heads. **Status: completed.**
 - c. AMOC et al.: discuss agency head comment in AMOC meeting on October 28-29 and determine course of action. **Status: pending; AMOC to discuss USFWS re-draft in 11/12 conference call.**
- 20. AMOC meeting scheduled for October 28-29 in Glenwood NM.
 - a. AMOC (assigned 9/30/08): submit agenda items to Terry Johnson by close-of-business on October 13. **Status: closed-out; no responses received.**
 - b. Terry Johnson (assigned 9/23/08): by November 2, draft Summary Notes and distribute them to AMOC et al. for review. **Status: completed 11/3.**
 - c. AMOC, IFTLs, FPC, and Signatory Cooperators (assigned 9/23/08): by November 7, submit review comments on draft Summary Notes to Terry Johnson. **Status: pending.**
 - d. Terry Johnson (assigned 9/23/08): by November 10, disseminate final (approved) Summary Notes and post them to Project Web site. **Status: pending.**
- 21. Renewal of 2003 MOU for BRWRA Reintroduction Project (assigned 9/9/08).
 - a. AMOC and Signatory Cooperators: provide update on their Director's perspective (or decision) on renewal in the October 28-29 AMOC meeting. **Status: pending; comment deadline extended to 11/14/08.**
- 22. Project Jurisdictional IFTL Checklist (assigned 9/23/08):
 - a. AMOC, IFTL, and FPC discussion of specific elements of the Checklist. **Status: completed in October 28-29 AMOC meeting.**
- 23. Submit revisions as appropriate for the three Project contact information summaries: Directors, AMOC, and SOP 0.C.
 - a. AMOC submits update information to AMOC Chair as changes occur (i.e. ongoing assignment). **Status: pending; routinely ignored by most Lead Agencies.**
 - b. AMOC Chair disseminates updated contact lists to AMOC, Signatory Cooperators, IFT, Lead Agency Directors, and Project Web site on the first of February, April, June, August, October, and December. **Status: pending; 11/08 updates issued; revision pending future AMOC submittals.**
- 24. Complete 2009 Annual Work Plan.
 - a. IFT submits draft to AMOC by October 15. **Status: completed 10/23.**
 - b. AMOC and IFT discussion in October 28-29 AMOC meeting and October 29 AMWG meeting. **Status: completed.**
 - c. IFT submits final draft to AMOC by November 7. **Status: pending; as of 10/28-29 AMOC meeting IFT will revise the FTE table and then AMOC Chair will revise the actual plan.**
 - d. AMOC, IFT, and Director final discussion in December 9-11 meeting. **Status: pending; final draft will be referred to Directors FYI as 12/9-10 AMOC meeting has been canceled.**

- e. IFT submits final to AMOC Chair by January 16 for final quality control. **Status: closed out; action obviated by 24c.**
 - f. AMOC Chair posts final to Project Web site and disseminates pdf to AMOC and notice of public availability in *ES Update* by January 23. **Status: pending; completion date revised to 11/30/08.**
25. Provide updates on status of EIS process.
- a. John Slown (self-assigned 10/1/08). **Status: completed in October 28-29 AMOC and AMWG meetings.**
26. Continue action on September 10 Management Decision on San Mateo Pack AM1114.
- a. IFT 30-day recommendation: due October 12. **Status: completed; recommendation received October 14 and disseminated to AMOC that same day.**
 - b. AMOC or Lead Agency Directors decision on IFT 30-day recommendation: due October 27. **Status: completed October 27.**